

Message

**From:** Chapman, Apple [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=C52A18BCF6164B6D9F04545DB694CAC1-ACHAPMAN]  
**Sent:** 9/25/2018 1:43:53 PM  
**To:** Portmess, Jessica [Portmess.Jessica@epa.gov]; Tim Sullivan (Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov) [Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov]  
**Subject:** FW: Ex. 7(A)

**Ex. 5 Deliberative Process & Attorney-Client / Ex. 7(A)**

Thanks.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* | Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 | 202-564-5666 (office) | 202-841-6076 (mobile) |

**From:** Traylor, Patrick  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 25, 2018 9:35 AM  
**To:** Starfield, Lawrence <Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov>; Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Ex. 7(A)

**Ex. 5 Deliberative Process & Attorney-Client / Ex. 7(A)**

**Patrick Traylor**  
Deputy Assistant Administrator  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
(202) 564-5238 (office)  
(202) 809-8796 (cell)

**From:** Starfield, Lawrence  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 25, 2018 9:31 AM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>; Traylor, Patrick <traylor.patrick@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Ex. 7(A)

Apple,

**Ex. 5 Deliberative Process & Attorney-Client / Ex. 7(A)**

Patrick?

Larry

This message is CONFIDENTIAL, and may contain legally privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient, or

believe you received this communication in error, please delete it immediately, do not copy, and notify the sender.  
Thank you.

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Monday, September 24, 2018 5:30 PM  
**To:** Starfield, Lawrence <[Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov](mailto:Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov)>; Traylor, Patrick <[traylor.patrick@epa.gov](mailto:traylor.patrick@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Ex. 7(A)

Larry,

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process & Attorney-Client / Ex. 7(A)

---

*Ms. Apple Chapman* | Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 | 202-564-5666 (office) | 202-841-6076 (mobile) |

---

**From:** Starfield, Lawrence  
**Sent:** Friday, September 21, 2018 11:49 AM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>; Traylor, Patrick <[traylor.patrick@epa.gov](mailto:traylor.patrick@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Ex. 7(A)

Absolutely. Thanks.

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Friday, September 21, 2018 11:43 AM  
**To:** Starfield, Lawrence <[Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov](mailto:Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov)>; Traylor, Patrick <[traylor.patrick@epa.gov](mailto:traylor.patrick@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Ex. 7(A)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process & Attorney-Client / Ex. 7(A)

 I do need to run it by the case team for input. I will forward these messages.

---

*Ms. Apple Chapman* | Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 | 202-564-5666 (office) | 202-841-6076 (mobile) |

---

**From:** Starfield, Lawrence  
**Sent:** Friday, September 21, 2018 11:40 AM  
**To:** Traylor, Patrick <[traylor.patrick@epa.gov](mailto:traylor.patrick@epa.gov)>; Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Ex. 7(A)

Agreed.

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process & Attorney-Client / Ex. 7(A)

Does that work?

Larry

This message is CONFIDENTIAL, and may contain legally privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient, or believe you received this communication in error, please delete it immediately, do not copy, and notify the sender. Thank you.

---

**From:** Traylor, Patrick

**Sent:** Friday, September 21, 2018 11:28 AM

**To:** Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>; Starfield, Lawrence <Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov>

**Subject:** RE: Ex. 7(A)

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process & Attorney-Client / Ex. 7(A)

**Patrick Traylor**

Deputy Assistant Administrator

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

(202) 564-5238 (office)

(202) 809-8796 (cell)

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple

**Sent:** Friday, September 21, 2018 10:20 AM

**To:** Starfield, Lawrence <Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov>

**Cc:** Traylor, Patrick <traylor.patrick@epa.gov>

**Subject:** RE: Ex. 7(A)

Larry,

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process & Attorney-Client / Ex. 7(A)

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process & Attorney-Client / Ex. 7(A)

*Ms. Apple Chapman* | Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 | 202-564-5666 (office) | 202-841-6076 (mobile) |

---

**From:** Starfield, Lawrence  
**Sent:** Thursday, September 20, 2018 5:29 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Traylor, Patrick <[traylor.patrick@epa.gov](mailto:traylor.patrick@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Ex. 7(A)

Apple:

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process & Attorney-Client / Ex. 7(A)

Thanks.

Larry

This message is CONFIDENTIAL, and may contain legally privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient, or believe you received this communication in error, please delete it immediately, do not copy, and notify the sender.  
Thank you.

---

**From:** Traylor, Patrick  
**Sent:** Thursday, September 20, 2018 5:12 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Starfield, Lawrence <[Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov](mailto:Starfield.Lawrence@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Ex. 7(A)

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process & Attorney-Client / Ex. 7(A)

**Patrick Traylor**  
Deputy Assistant Administrator  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
(202) 564-5238 (office)  
(202) 809-8796 (cell)